



CITY OF SOLANA BEACH

CLIMATE ACTION COMMISSION

Wednesday, November 17, 2021, 5:30 PM

Teleconference Location Only-City Hall/Council Chambers, 635 S. Highway 101, Solana Beach, California

This meeting will be conducted in accordance with Government Code sections 54953(e) and 54954.3 and other applicable law.

<https://cosb-org.zoom.us/j/89890921193?pwd=V2FtQmluSHJUd2Z1Tk9zL2swZVcvdz09>

Passcode: 053802

833 548 0282 (Toll Free) or 877 853 5257 (Toll Free)

MEETING LOCATION WILL NOT BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC

In person participation at City Council meetings is **not** allowed at this time. There will be **no** members of the public in attendance at public meetings. Alternatives to in-person attendance for viewing and participating in meetings are being provided under Public Participation.

- 1. CALL TO ORDER**
- 2. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**
- 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PAST MEETING**
 - A. Meeting of October 20, 2021
- 4. PUBLIC COMMENT**
- 5. PRESENTATION – USD Environment Initiatives Hub by Darbi Berry, Director (15 MINUTES)**
- 6. UPDATE FROM SUBCOMMITTEES:**
 - A. **PUBLIC OUTREACH – Update (10 MINUTES)**
 - B. **DECARBONIZATION STRATEGIES Update and discussion of Agenda Item B2 from November 10, 2021 Council Meeting (20 MINUTES)**
- 7. RECOMMENDATION AND VOTE TO APPOINT 5TH JUNIOR COMMISSIONER- Junior Commissioner Selection Subcommittee (5 MINUTES)**
- 8. JUNIOR COMMISSIONER MEMBER INTRODUCTION – Including COP26 Reflections (10 MINUTES)**
- 9. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE VOTE ON DRAFT CLIMATE JUSTICE CHAPTER – Chair Goodmacher to present latest draft for Commission consideration and possible vote on final approval (25 MINUTES)**
- 10. CANCELLATION OF REGULARLY SCHEDULED DECEMBER MEETING**

(5 MINUTES)

11. **NEW/PROPOSED BUSINESS:** New or proposed business provides an opportunity for Commissioners to discuss items not on the agenda but that may be added to the CAC agenda/workload at a future date. Pursuant to the Brown Act, there will be no action taken on these items.

12. ADJOURNMENT

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Written correspondence regarding an agenda item at an open session meeting should be submitted to the rviskanta@cosb.org

The designated location for viewing public documents is the City's website www.cityofsolanabeach.org. Please see the City's website for any updates.

OR

Verbal comment participation: If you wish to provide a live verbal comment during the meeting, attend the virtual meeting via your computer or call in.

Before Meeting

- Alert Us Please. We ask that you alert us that you will joining the meeting to speak. Please email us at rviskanta@cosb.org to alert us to which item you will speak on to allow us to manage speakers more efficiently.
- Public Comment Link: To provide public comment log in to the meeting at the link at the top of the agenda.
- During each Agenda Item and Public Comment (non-agenda items), attendees will be asked if they would like to speak. Speakers are taken during each agenda item.
- Speakers will be asked to raise their hand (zoom icon under participants can be clicked or on the phone you can dial *9) if they would like to be called on to speak during each item.
- Choose Gallery View to see the presentations, when applicable.

SPECIAL ASSISTANCE NEEDED - AMERICAN DISABILITIES ACT TITLE 2

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990, persons with a disability may request an agenda in appropriate alternative formats as required by Section 202. Any person with a disability who requires a modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting should direct such request to the rviskanta@cosb.org (858) 720-2400 at least 72 hours prior to the meeting.

Climate Impacts and ~~Social Equity~~Climate Justice

MARY'S INPUT: The need to bring more of a global perspective into this document. She also noted the issue of outdoor workers in particular and how their needs can be accommodated.

A number of cities throughout the world have declared themselves in the midst of a climate emergency. Solana Beach joined them last year and yet little action has occurred to address this issue. One of the aspects of the climate emergency that has come to the fore is the realization that climate emergencies and climate emergency solutions do not impact communities and diverse populations equally. The benefits and burdens of both the "emergencies" and the "solutions" to the emergencies are felt inequitably. It has been noted repeatedly that economic deprivation and minority status create a greater vulnerability to the effects of climate change. These highly impacted groups suffer more from climate change, have poorer health quality, fewer access to resources and adequate housing, and suffer from higher rates of unemployment and underemployment. Spreading the benefits of climate change solutions to low income and minority communities will reduce this burden.

The presence of Climate Change related social injustices around the country demands the development of equitable solutions. It is also clear that unless Climate Action Plans deal with these inequities pro-actively, the inequities will continue to exist and flourish to the detriment of all our communities and will impact our ability to sustain and plan a high-quality future for all of our residents. It seems evident that our Climate Action Plans must create policies to deal with existing inequities and those likely to emerge in future scenarios if B.A.U. (Business As Usual) processes are allowed to continue. Fortunately, many cities, large and small, have created and appear to be continuing to create energy systems (CCAs) that promote clean fuels and result eventually in revenue for the cities. The cities can utilize all or a portion of that revenue to invest in local or regional programs that will help alleviate inequities.

GROUP INPUT: NEED TO BRING IN ~~RENTERS-RENTAL COMMUNITY~~ TO THIS DOCUMENT

Solana Beach as a Community ~~and Potentially Vulnerable Populations~~

Solana Beach is a small fairly wealthy community in northern coastal San Diego County. According to SANDAG (www.sandag.org) median home prices in Solana Beach are more than twice as high as those in San Diego County as a whole.

According to the December 2020 Draft Housing Element (Housing Element) issued by the city our current population of approximately 13,000 is expected to increase 14% to nearly 15,000 by 2050. According to the Housing Element Solana Beach's population has been skewing older since 2000. The Housing Element notes other changes in Solana Beach's population from 2000 to 2017 including decreases in the percentage of the population identified: as white (from 87% to 83.4%) and Hispanic or Latino (from 14.8% to 11.5%). At the same time the percentage of Solana Beach's population identifying as Asian increased from 3.5% to 5.1%. Similar increases occurred in other populations including black, American Indian or Alaska Native, Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander, Other Races, Two or More Races.

Understanding the nature of the population is important. An aging population has different and/or changing needs for housing due to changes in accessibility and accommodations that may be required. Further, it has been shown that many older residents lack either access to or the ability to use modern information technologies e.g., the internet, email, or cellular telephones.

Understanding the ethnic and racial profile of a community is important as race and ethnicity correlate closely with income level and poverty. Both of which impact housing needs. According to the Housing Element, although the majority of Solana Beach's population is white, poverty is highest among our city's minority populations.

The Housing Element also provides information on the household income of Solana Beach's residents by breaking it down using Area Median Income (AMI) levels identified by the State of California Department of Housing and Community Development. According to the Housing Element in 2017 approximately 24% of households in Solana Beach fall into the low to extremely low-income categories. The levels and percentages of our population in each category as shown in the Housing Element are presented on Table One below.

Table One – Income Categories in Solana Beach		
Income Category (Percent of County AMI)	Number of Households	Percent of Households
Extremely Low (30% of AMI or Less)	330	5.7%
Very Low (31 to 50% of AMI)	355	6.2%
Low (51 to 80% of AMI)	695	12.1%
Moderate or Above (over 80% of AMI)	4,365	76%

As presented in the Housing Element the population of Solana Beach in 2017 differs from the San Diego County averages in the following ways:

- * Our percentage of people under the age of 18 is slightly less (~16% in Solana Beach vs. 22% County-wide);
- * Our percentage of people over the age of 65 is quite a bit higher (~23% in Solana Beach vs. ~13% County-wide);
- * Our percentage of people living in poverty is less (8% in Solana Beach vs. 12% County-wide);
- * Our percentage of people who are non-English speakers at home is less (21% in Solana Beach vs. 36% County-wide);
- * Our percentage of people with a less than high school education is less (6% in Solana Beach vs. 15% County-wide)

From the numbers and discussion outlined it is apparent that although we are a fairly wealthy community compared to others in the San Diego area, we still have a significant fraction of our population that is: 1. older, 2. living in poverty, and 3. non-English speakers at home. An aging population in a community is important to note because of the changing or additional needs in housing costs, accessibility, and accommodations that an aging population may require. According to the Housing Element nearly 40% of households in Solana Beach experience one of four housing problems (e.g., units with physical defects, overcrowding, cost burdens including utilities exceeding 30% of gross income). In addition, the high percentage of non-English speakers in our population mandates that city documents and outreach be available in languages other than English.

Solana Beach and Environmental Justice

Another way to look at our community is to review its status with regards to Environmental Justice (EJ). Both the United State Environmental Protection Agency (EPA; <https://ejscreen.epa.gov/mapper/>) and the State of California (State; <https://calenviroscreen-oehha.hub.arcgis.com/>) have map-based websites that present Environmental Justice criteria by geographic area, city limits, Census Tracts, etc.

The EPA EJ Index combines environmental and demographic data to come up with a score for a given geographic area (city, census tracts, etc.). The scores for that are ranked and can then be compared to percentile scores for the state, EPA Region, or that country as a whole. There are eleven environmental indicators that are evaluated. These are:

- * National Scale Air Toxics Assessment Air Toxics Cancer Risk

- * National Scale Air Toxics Assessment Respiratory Hazard Index
- * National Scale Air Toxics Assessment Diesel PM (DPM)
- * Particulate Matter (PM2.5)
- * Ozone
- * Lead Paint Indicator
- * Traffic Proximity and Volume
- * Proximity to Risk Management Plan Sites
- * Proximity to Treatment Storage and Disposal Facilities
- * Proximity to National Priorities List Sites
- * Wastewater Discharge Indicator

Per the EPA, Solana Beach as whole ranks in the lowest half of California (meaning that we are better off than at least half of the state) with respect to most of the environmental indicators. However, there are two environmental indicators in which the city ranks poorly. These are proximity to traffic and to wastewater discharges.

The Draft State of California CalEnviroScreen 4.0 uses similar (but not identical) criteria (environmental indicators and demographic information) to the EPA to rank communities in terms of their Environmental Justice scoring. On the CalEnviroScreen website it is possible to quickly evaluate smaller portions of the city (census tracts) to examine their rankings. There are four census tracts in the City of Solana Beach. The attached map shows the approximate boundaries of these tracts. Note that Tracts 173.05 and 173.06 do include areas just outside the city limits.



MAP OF CENSUS TRACTS IN SOLANA BEACH

Per the draft CalEnviroScreen 4.0 website, exposures for each of the census tracts in Solana Beach are negatively scored compared to the rest of the state (above the 50th percentile) for Traffic. The exposures above the 50th percentile for each of the four census tracts are shown on Table 2 below.

Census Tracts	Category Exceeding 50 th Percentile	Percentile Ranking
Census Tract 173.03	Diesel Particulate Matter	77
	Traffic	90
Census Tract 173.04	Diesel Particulate Matter	81
	Traffic	92
Census Tract 173.05	Traffic	79
	Pesticides	56
Census Tract 173.06	Traffic	81

The draft CalEnviroScreen 4.0 website also ranks “Environmental Threats” on a similar percentile scale. Again, a percentile value above 50 indicates a score that exceeds the rest of the state. The “Environmental Threats” above the 50th percentile for each of the four census tracts are shown on Table 3 below.

Census Tracts	Environmental Threats	Percentile Ranking	Possible Reasons
Census Tract 173.03	Impaired Waters	52	Proximity to polluted or impacted San Elijo Lagoon
Census Tract 173.04	Groundwater Threats	61	Proximity to polluted or impacted Stevens Creek
	Impaired Waters	60	
Census Tract 173.05	Groundwater Threats	64	Proximity to polluted or impacted San Elijo Lagoon
	Impaired Waters	64	
	Solid Waste	52	Proximity to closed landfill
Census Tract 173.06	Groundwater Threats	61	Proximity to polluted or impacted San Elijo Lagoon
	Impaired Waters	60	

Finally, the draft CalEnviroScreen 4.0 website also ranks “Socioeconomic Factors” on a similar percentile scale. Only one of the census tracts in Solana Beach is ranked above the 50-percentile compared to the rest of the state. Census Tract 173.04 ranks poorly on Housing Burden. The State of California defines Housing Burdened households as those low-income households that are highly burdened by housing costs. These households are typically lower income and must spend a larger proportion of their income on housing. As a consequence, they may suffer from housing-induced poverty. According to data presented on the CalEnviroScreen 4.0 website nearly 24% of the population in Census Tract 173.04 are Housing Burdened. An unacceptable number in such a wealthy community.

Commented [JG1]: Michael commented: That he did not find value in these numbers and thought that they should be summarized in some way. I note that these are just data dumps and are similarly used in other sections of the CAP (e.g. Climate Adaptation).

Climate Impacts, Social Equity, and Goals Strategies to Address Climate Justice

Policies and appropriate measures and future targets must be designed and implemented that will do the following:

- * Create an outreach program that appeals to all residents, all income levels, and all populations that describes benefits and burdens of Climate Change plan components (this program needs to be available in multiple languages and to those unreachable by electronic means);
- * Place electric vehicle charging stations in all public parks (La Colonia Park, Fletcher Cove, etc.) and facilities for residents to use;
- * Design and implement a clean transportation (electric bus) program that will be beneficial to all residents and all populations, including transit stops (centers/hubs) sited throughout the City;
- * Partner with the neighborhood schools to design and implement a clean transportation (electric bus) program for students and encourage parents to stop driving their children to and from school;
- * ~~Partner with the CEA to provide free home energy audits and upgrade incentives for low-income households;~~
- * Invest in programs that provide clean energy generation upgrades for low income and senior residents. This includes weatherization and conversion to clean electric appliances instead of indoor and outdoor polluting gas appliances;
- * Partner with local colleges and universities to provide educational and workforce opportunities in clean tech;
- * Create the opportunities by making housing available for all people to live and experience the environment that we treasure here in Solana Beach regardless of their income level;
- * Ensure that all new construction, especially multiunit dwellings, meets high quality energy standards (zero net energy) to reduce energy use and heating costs;
- * Create opportunities for gainful employment in the immediate area to reduce the need for commuting. ~~This includes allowing the conversion of existing retail buildings to offices;~~
- * Create training programs in conjunction with local colleges and universities for local residents to give them the opportunity to participate fully in the economy we are hoping to create.

HERE ARE WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FROM COMMISSIONERS.

Paul:

To save time, I'll just enter my comments here. Don't forget to address equitable access to clean water as climate change makes it more expensive. Consider the disproportionate burden on our gardeners, who face both hotter working conditions and the cost of replacing their dirty gasoline tools with electric motors. Public electric buses are mentioned. Explore making those available for kids to go to/from school to take a lot of cars off the road (We had this where I lived in Australia and it made very efficient use of the bus system). Finally, I support "Climate Justice" over "Climate Equity" or any of the other names mentioned. We are not trying to make the climate equal for everyone, rather we are trying to avoid injustice due to climate change.

Mary:

Increase in Temperatures and Extreme Heat;

Variable Water Supplies;

Increased Risk of Wildfire;

Coastal Erosion and Sea Level Rise;

Flooding;

Increased Energy System Demand;

Threats to Public Health and Safety;

Threats to Coastal Habitat; and

Climate Justice.

FROM EVA:

Looking at the links you sent me and thinking about Solana Beach in particular, I'm thinking about the importance of reliable public transportation, as many older residents and low-income residents do not have a driver's license. In addition, we should ensure that EV chargers are placed in our lower-income areas and not just in the richer areas. Maybe also consider how gentrification can negatively impact communities like La Colonia? New "tech-y" buildings, systems, and construction can generate more environmental harm than improving the energy efficiency and eco-friendliness of existing homes and stores. I think the MOST important thing to do is to at the bare minimum acknowledge the disparities among different socioeconomic classes in Solana Beach, and identify what that really means in our city specifically.

- There are a lot of things that the Mexican-American community does culturally that are far more sustainable than what the "rich white" community in Solana Beach does. :) I know that in Germany, where my dad grows up, the culture is far different than here in America. They conserve resources more and are more inclined to be conscious about their energy use. In their culture, it is more common to sit down and make a home-cooked meal rather than go out to get take-out food. I can imagine that it may be similar in the Mexican culture.

- As for the social equity chapter of the Climate Action Plan, I hadn't yet thought about how the implementation of things like tree canopies or increased public transportation could be measured. I think your ideas about having a measurable goal - 30% more trees or make a contract with Uber - are important to think about. I'm even wondering whether we could increase bike donation programs? Or create more job opportunities with higher wages to plant more trees/grow garden beds? The California Climate Action Corps program could be something to think about incorporating into Solana Beach as well.

ALSO FROM MARY:

Nice, useful information on SB demographics. I think the reference to older residents who are not as savvy as most on current day info technologies is important and special outreach efforts should be made. Suggestions on p 4-5 also very good.

Here are some more thoughts.

1) Might want to decide on terminology (Social Equity v Environmental Justice v Climate Justice): Since this pertains to the CAP, and the Jan 2020 Climate Adaptation Chapter has a section on Climate Justice, CJ may be preferable.

2) Which leads me to the question of how the entire CAP is to be organized. Is this CJ (using CJ for convenience until a decision is made) chapter a standalone that covers demographics or will it also include sections on extreme heat, SLR, wildfires etc but w/the emphasis on how these relate to CJ?

If the latter, the info below may be of interest and could be included.

UCS released a new report, *Too Hot to Work: Assessing the Threats Climate Change Poses to Outdoor Workers*, elevating attention to the growing health threat and economic impact of extreme heat. This research finds that between now and 2065, **climate change will quadruple U.S. outdoor workers' exposure to hazardous heat conditions, jeopardizing their health and placing up to \$55.4 billion of their earnings at risk annually if no action is taken to reduce emissions.**

Workers who identify as people of color risk losing an estimated \$23.5 billion in annual earnings by midcentury, which could exacerbate existing inequities resulting from centuries of systemic racism. Outdoor workers will increasingly have to choose between their health and their paychecks.

Several notable media outlets have featured the report including National Public Radio, *The Miami Herald*, *The Guardian*, *Mother Jones*, *Tampa Bay Times*, and E&E News, among many others.

In addition to the report, we have developed a short video conveying the topline findings of the report. UCS has also developed fact sheets specifically for individual congressional districts and our mapping tool provides a geographic view of the data, down to the county-level.

3) Although this is a SB CAP, our City is not isolated. The effects of the climate crisis are experienced worldwide and unequally. Climate justice, or rather climate injustice is felt much more severely in other parts of the world. I believe that it is important to remind folks of this and be somewhat informed wrt climate refugees and mass migrations. These topics also have special relevance since we live in a border region. Although this is a big subject area, reference to it in our CAP does not have to be extensive – see for example.

<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2020/07/23/magazine/climate-migration.html>

<https://www.unhcr.org/en-us/climate-change-and-disasters.html>

<https://news.climate.columbia.edu/wp-content/themes/sotp-foundation/dataviz/heat-humidity-map/>